

When Eid Salah and Jumu'a Salah Coincide: Imam al-Ṭaḥāwī's Analysis of the Narrations

The following text is from Imam Abū Ja'far Aḥmad ibn Muḥammad al-Ṭaḥāwī's (d. 321 AH/933 CE) renowned work *Sharḥ Mushkil al-Āthār*. Al-Ṭaḥāwī was one of the most distinguished scholars of the early Ḥanafī school and a master of ḥadīth and jurisprudence (fiqh). His *Sharḥ Mushkil al-Āthār* represents a crucial source for understanding early Ḥanafī legal methodology and provides invaluable evidence for the school's approach to reconciling apparently contradictory ḥadīth reports.

In this particular chapter, al-Ṭaḥāwī addresses the complex issue of when two religious festivals (Eids) occur on the same day, specifically when an Eid Salah coincides with the Friday prayer (Jumu'a Salah). The text demonstrates the sophisticated hermeneutical methods employed by early Ḥanafī scholars in resolving apparent contradictions between religious texts and legal principles. Al-Ṭaḥāwī's analysis shows how the school interpreted prophetic traditions regarding dispensations from Friday prayer in light of broader legal frameworks concerning urban versus rural religious obligations. The position of the Ḥanafī school is not an isolated one but also reflects the stance of other major Sunnī schools of law, as shall be demonstrated below.

Al-Ṭaḥāwī's work serves as important evidence for the early development of Ḥanafī jurisprudence, illustrating how the school's founders and early authorities engaged with complex textual interpretation [ta'wīl] while maintaining fidelity to both the apparent [zāhir] meanings of texts and the systematic coherence of Islamic law. In addition to what al-Ṭaḥāwī mentioned a translation from the *Maqālāt* of **Shaykh Muḥammad Zāhid ibn al-Ḥasan al-Kawtharī** (d. 1951) has also been included and the reader is asked to read the end notes for other scholarly quotations from classical authorities.

Eid (عيد) in Arabic literally means "festival" or "celebration." In Islamic terminology, this refers primarily to the two major annual festivals: Eid al-

Fitr (Festival of Breaking the Fast) after Ramadan, and Eid al-Adha (Festival of Sacrifice) during the Hajj season. However, Friday is also considered an Eid in Islamic tradition because the Prophet Muhammad ﷺ explicitly called it so as the following Hadiths mentioned.

In Sunan Ibn Mājah:

١٠٩٨ - حَدَّثَنَا عَمَّارُ بْنُ خَالِدِ الْوَاسِطِيِّ قَالَ: حَدَّثَنَا عَلِيُّ بْنُ غُرَابٍ، عَنْ صَالِحِ بْنِ أَبِي الْأَخْضَرِ، عَنِ الرَّهْرِيِّ عَنْ عُبَيْدِ بْنِ السَّبَّاقِ، عَنِ ابْنِ عَبَّاسٍ، قَالَ: قَالَ رَسُولُ اللَّهِ ﷺ: «إِنَّ هَذَا يَوْمٌ عِيدٌ، جَعَلَهُ اللَّهُ لِلْمُسْلِمِينَ، فَمَنْ جَاءَ إِلَى الْجُمُعَةِ فَلْيَغْتَسِلْ، وَإِنْ كَانَ طَيِّبٌ فَلْيَمَسْ مِنْهُ، وَعَلَيْكُمْ بِالسِّوَاكِ

1098 - 'Ammār ibn Khālid al-Wāsiṭī narrated to us, he said: 'Alī ibn Ghurāb narrated to us, from Ṣāliḥ ibn Abī al-Akhḍar, from al-Zuhri, from 'Ubayd ibn al-Sabbāq, from Ibn 'Abbās, he said: The Messenger of Allah ﷺ said: **"Indeed, this is a day of Eid that Allah has made for the Muslims.** So, whoever comes to Friday [prayer], let him perform ghusl [ritual bathing], and if there is perfume available, let him apply some of it, and upon you is [the use of] the tooth-stick [siwāk]."

Imam Shihāb al-Dīn al-Būṣīrī (d. 840 AH) recorded the following in his Ithāf al-Khiyra al-Mahara bi-Zawā'id al-Masānīd al-'Ashara (2/276):

١٥١١ - وَعَنْ ابْنِ السَّبَّاقِ: «أَنَّ النَّبِيَّ ﷺ قَالَ فِي جُمُعَةٍ مِنَ الْجُمُعِ: إِنَّ هَذَا يَوْمٌ عِيدٌ جَعَلَهُ اللَّهُ - ﷻ لِلْمُسْلِمِينَ فَاغْتَسِلُوا، وَمَنْ كَانَ عِنْدَهُ طَيِّبٌ فَلَا يَصُرُّهُ أَنْ يَمَسَّ مِنْهُ، وَعَلَيْكُمْ بِالسِّوَاكِ.» رَوَاهُ مُسَدَّدٌ وَالْبَيْهَقِيُّ مُرْسَلًا بِسَنَدٍ رِجَالُهُ ثِقَاتٌ. وَرَوَاهُ الْبَيْهَقِيُّ مَرْفُوعًا مِنْ حَدِيثِ أَبِي هُرَيْرَةَ وَمِنْ حَدِيثِ أَنَسٍ وَقَالَ: الصَّحِيحُ أَنَّهُ مُرْسَلٌ

1511 - From Ibn al-Sabbāq: **"That the Prophet ﷺ said on one of the Fridays: 'Indeed, this is a day of Eid that Allah has made for the Muslims,** so perform ghusl [ritual bathing], and whoever has perfume, it will not harm him to apply some of it, and upon you is the use of the tooth-stick [siwāk]."

Musaddad and al-Bayhaqī narrated it as a disconnected type of report [mursal] with a chain whose men are trustworthy [thiqāt]. Al-Bayhaqī narrated it as an elevated report [marfū'] from the hadith of Abū Hurayra and from the hadith of Anas, and he said: "The correct view is that it is a disconnected type of report [mursal]."

Translation from Sharḥ Mushkil al-Āthār¹:

بَابُ بَيَانِ مُشْكِلِ مَا رُوِيَ عَنْ رَسُولِ اللَّهِ ﷺ فِي الْعِيدَيْنِ يَجْتَمِعَانِ فِي الْيَوْمِ الْوَاحِدِ

Chapter: Clarification of the Problematic Issues Narrated from the Messenger of Allah ﷺ Regarding Two Eids Occurring on the Same Day

١١٥٣ - حَدَّثَنَا عَلِيُّ بْنُ مَعْنَدٍ، قَالَ: حَدَّثَنَا يَحْيَى بْنُ أَبِي بُكَيْرٍ الْكِرْمَانِيُّ، قَالَ: حَدَّثَنَا إِسْرَائِيلُ بْنُ يُونُسَ، عَنْ عُثْمَانَ بْنِ الْمُغِيرَةَ، قَالَ: سَمِعْتُ إِيَّاسَ بْنَ أَبِي رَمْلَةَ، قَالَ: سَمِعْتُ مُعَاوِيَةَ بْنَ أَبِي سُفْيَانَ، وَهُوَ يَسْأَلُ زَيْدَ بْنَ أَرْقَمَ قَالَ: شَهِدْتُ مَعَ رَسُولِ اللَّهِ ﷺ عِيدَيْنِ اجْتَمَعَا فِي يَوْمٍ وَاحِدٍ؟ فَقَالَ: نَعَمْ، فَقَالَ: فَكَيْفَ صَنَعَ؟ قَالَ: صَلَّى ثُمَّ رَخَّصَ فِي الْجُمُعَةِ فَقَالَ: «مَنْ شَاءَ أَنْ يُصَلِّيَ فَلْيُصَلِّ» [١٨٧] قَالَ أَبُو جَعْفَرٍ: وَعُثْمَانُ هَذَا هُوَ ابْنُ عَمِّ الْحَجَّاجِ بْنِ يُونُسَ

1153 - 'Alī ibn Ma'bad narrated to us, he said: Yaḥyā ibn Abī Bukayr al-Karmānī narrated to us, he said: Isrā'īl ibn Yūnus narrated to us, from 'Uthmān ibn al-Mughīra, he said: I heard Iyās ibn Abī Ramla, he said: I heard Mu'āwiya ibn Abī Sufyān while he was asking Zayd ibn Arqam, he said: "Did you witness with the Messenger of Allah ﷺ two Eids that occurred on one day?" He said: "Yes." He said: "How did he act?" He said: "He prayed, then gave a dispensation [rukḥṣa] regarding Friday prayer, so he said: 'Whoever wishes to pray, let him pray.'" [187] Abū Ja'far said: This 'Uthmān is the cousin of al-Ḥajjāj ibn Yūsuf.

١١٥٤ - حَدَّثَنَا بَكَّارُ بْنُ فُتَيْبَةَ، قَالَ: حَدَّثَنَا أَبُو دَاوُدَ صَاحِبُ الطَّيَالِسَةِ قَالَ: حَدَّثَنَا إِسْرَائِيلُ، قَالَ: حَدَّثَنَا عُثْمَانُ بْنُ الْمُغِيرَةَ بْنِ أَبِي زُرْعَةَ مِنْ آلِ أَبِي عَقِيلٍ عَنْ إِيَّاسِ بْنِ أَبِي رَمْلَةَ الشَّامِيِّ، قَالَ: شَهِدْتُ مُعَاوِيَةَ سَأَلَ زَيْدَ بْنَ أَرْقَمَ أَشَهِدْتَ عِيدَيْنِ مَعَ رَسُولِ اللَّهِ ﷺ اجْتَمَعَا؟ قَالَ: نَعَمْ، قَالَ: فَمَا صَنَعَ؟ قَالَ: «صَلَّى الْعِيدَ وَرَخَّصَ فِي الْجُمُعَةِ» «مَنْ شَاءَ أَنْ يَجْلِسَ فَلْيَجْلِسْ»

1154 - Bakkār ibn Qutayba narrated to us, he said: Abū Dāwūd, the owner of the ṭayālisa, narrated to us, he said: Isrā'īl narrated to us, he said: 'Uthmān ibn al-Mughīra ibn Abī Zur'a from the family of Abū 'Aqīl narrated to us, from Iyās ibn Abī Ramla al-Shāmī, he said: I witnessed Mu'āwiya ask Zayd ibn Arqam: "Did you witness two Eids with the Messenger of Allah ﷺ that occurred together?" He said: "Yes." He said: "What did he do?" He said: "He prayed the Eid prayer and gave a dispensation regarding Friday prayer - whoever wishes to sit [and not attend Friday prayer], let him sit."

فَسَأَلَ سَائِلٌ عَنِ الْمُرَادِ بِمَا فِي هَدْيَيْنِ الْحَدِيثَيْنِ بَعْدَ اسْتِعْظَامِهِ مَا فِيهِمَا مِنَ الرَّخْصَةِ فِي تَرْكِ الْجُمُعَةِ وَنَقَى ذَلِكَ عَنْ رَسُولِ اللَّهِ ﷺ، وَقَالَ: كَيْفَ يَكُونُ لِأَحَدٍ أَنْ يَتَخَلَّفَ عَنِ الْجُمُعَةِ مَعَ قَوْلِ اللَّهِ عَزَّ وَجَلَّ ﴿يَا أَيُّهَا الَّذِينَ آمَنُوا إِذَا نُودِيَ لِلصَّلَاةِ مِنْ يَوْمِ الْجُمُعَةِ فَاسْعَوْا إِلَى ذِكْرِ اللَّهِ﴾ [الجمعة: ٩]؟ [الآية

A questioner asked about the meaning of what is in these two hadiths after he considered grave what is in them regarding the dispensation to abandon Friday prayer, and he denied this from the Messenger of Allah ﷺ, and said: "How can it be for anyone to stay away from Friday prayer with the saying of Allah, Mighty and Majestic: 'O you who believe! When the call is made for prayer on Friday, then hurry to the remembrance of Allah' [al-Jumu'a: 9]?" - the verse.

فَكَانَ جَوَابَنَا لَهُ فِي ذَلِكَ بِتَوْفِيقِ اللَّهِ وَعَوْنِهِ أَنَّ الْمُرَادِينَ بِالرَّخْصَةِ فِي تَرْكِ الْجُمُعَةِ فِي هَدْيَيْنِ الْحَدِيثَيْنِ هُمْ أَهْلُ الْعَوَالِي الَّذِينَ مَنَازِلُهُمْ خَارِجَةٌ عَنِ الْمَدِينَةِ مِمَّنْ لَيْسَتْ الْجُمُعَةُ عَلَيْهِمْ وَاجِبَةً؛ لِأَنَّهُمْ فِي غَيْرِ مِصْرٍ مِنَ الْأَمْصَارِ وَالْجُمُعَةُ فَإِنَّمَا تَجِبُ عَلَى أَهْلِ الْأَمْصَارِ، وَفِي [١٨٨] الْأَمْصَارِ دُونَ مَا سِوَى ذَلِكَ

Our answer to him in this matter, by Allah's guidance and assistance, was that **those intended by the dispensation to abandon Friday prayer in these two hadiths are the people of the highlands [awālī] whose dwellings are outside Madina, from among those upon whom Friday prayer is not obligatory, because they are not in a city [miṣr] from among the cities, and Friday prayer is only obligatory upon the people of the cities, and in [188] the cities, not elsewhere.**

كَمَا رُوِيَ عَنْ عَلِيِّ عَلَيْهِ السَّلَامُ فِي ذَلِكَ مِمَّا نُحِبُّطُ عَلْمًا أَنَّهُ لَمْ يَقُلْهُ رَأْيًا إِذْ كَانَ مِثْلَهُ لَا يُقَالُ بِالرَّأْيِ، وَأَنَّهُ لَمْ يَقُلْهُ إِلَّا تَوْقِيفًا وَلَا تَوْقِيفٌ يُوْجَدُ فِي ذَلِكَ إِلَّا مِنْ رَسُولِ اللَّهِ ﷺ

As narrated from 'Alī, peace be upon him, regarding this matter, which we know with certainty that he did not say as a personal opinion [ra'y], since such a matter cannot be said based on personal opinion, and that he only said it as a transmitted instruction [tawqīf], and no transmitted instruction is found in this except from the Messenger of Allah ﷺ.

وَهُوَ مَا قَدْ حَدَّثَنَا إِبْرَاهِيمُ بْنُ مَرْزُوقٍ قَالَ: حَدَّثَنَا أَبُو الْوَلِيدِ الطَّيَالِسِيُّ قَالَ: حَدَّثَنَا شُعْبَةُ عَنْ زُبَيْدِ الْإِيَامِيِّ قَالَ: سَمِعْتُ سَعْدَ بْنَ عُبَيْدَةَ، عَنْ أَبِي عَبْدِ الرَّحْمَنِ عَنْ عَلِيِّ عَلَيْهِ السَّلَامُ قَالَ: «لَا جُمُعَةَ وَلَا تَشْرِيْقَ إِلَّا فِي مِصْرٍ مِنَ الْأَمْصَارِ»

And this is what Ibrāhīm ibn Marzūq narrated to us, he said: Abū al-Walīd al-Ṭayālīsī narrated to us, he said: Shu'ba narrated to us, from Zubayd al-Iyāmī, he said: I heard Sa'd ibn 'Ubayda, from Abī 'Abd al-Raḥmān, from 'Alī, peace be upon him, he said: "There is no Friday prayer and no sacrifice [tashrīq] except in a city from among the cities."

وَمَا قَدْ حَدَّثَنَا إِبْرَاهِيمُ، قَالَ: حَدَّثَنَا وَهْبُ بْنُ جَرِيرٍ قَالَ: حَدَّثَنَا شُعْبَةُ عَنْ زُبَيْدِ بْنِ سَعْدِ بْنِ عُبَيْدَةَ عَنْ أَبِي عَبْدِ الرَّحْمَنِ «عَنْ عَلِيِّ قَالَ»: لَا جُمُعَةَ وَلَا تَشْرِيْقَ إِلَّا فِي مِصْرٍ جَامِعٍ

And what Ibrāhīm narrated to us, he said: Wahb ibn Jarīr narrated to us, he said: Shu'ba narrated to us, from Zubayd, from Sa'd ibn 'Ubayda, from Abī 'Abd al-Raḥmān, from 'Alī, he said: "There is no Friday prayer and no sacrifice except in a congregational city [miṣr jāmi']".

قَالَ أَبُو جَعْفَرٍ: فَكَانَ أَهْلُ الْعَوَالِي الَّذِينَ لَيْسُوا فِي مِصْرٍ مِنَ الْأَمْصَارِ لَهُمُ التَّخْلُفُ عَنِ الْجُمُعَاتِ، وَمَنْ كَانَ لَهُ التَّخْلُفُ عَنِ الْجُمُعَاتِ كَانَ لَهُ التَّخْلُفُ عَنِ الْجَمَاعَاتِ سِوَاهَا فِي صَلَوَاتِ الْأَعْيَادِ وَمِمَّا سِوَاهَا، وَكَانُوا إِذَا حَضَرُوا الْأَمْصَارَ لِصَلَوَاتِ الْأَعْيَادِ كَانُوا بِذَلِكَ فِي مَوْضِعٍ عَلَى أَهْلِهِ حُضُورُ تِلْكَ الصَّلَاةِ، يَعْنِي: صَلَاةَ الْجُمُعَةِ وَمَا سِوَاهَا مِنْ صَلَوَاتِ الْأَعْيَادِ

Abū Ja'far said: So, the people of the highlands who are not in a city from among the cities are permitted to stay away from Friday prayers, and whoever is permitted to stay away from Friday prayers is permitted to stay away from other congregational prayers in Eid prayers and others. When they attended the cities for Eid prayers, they were thereby in a place whose people are required to attend that prayer, meaning: Friday prayer and other Eid prayers.

فَاعْلَمَهُمْ رَسُولُ اللَّهِ ﷺ بِمَا فِي هَذَيْنِ الْحَدِيثَيْنِ أَنَّهُمْ لَيْسَ عَلَيْهِمْ أَنْ يُقِيمُوا بِمَكَانِهِمُ الَّذِي حَضَرُوهُ لِصَلَاةِ الْعِيدِ حَتَّى يَدْخُلَ عَلَيْهِمْ وَقْتُ الْجُمُعَةِ وَهُمْ بِهِ، فَتَجِبُ عَلَيْهِمُ الْجُمُعَةُ كَمَا تَجِبُ عَلَى أَهْلِ ذَلِكَ الْمَكَانِ؛ لِأَنَّهُ مِصْرٌ مِنَ الْأَمْصَارِ وَجَعَلَ لَهُمْ أَنْ يُقِيمُوا بِهِ اخْتِيَارًا حَتَّى يُصَلُّوا فِيهِ الْجُمُعَةَ أَوْ يَنْصَرِفُوا عَنْهُ إِلَى أَمَاكِنِهِمْ، وَيَتْرَكُونَ الْإِقَامَةَ لِلْجُمُعَةِ، فَيَكُونُ رُجُوعُهُمْ إِلَى أَمَاكِنِهِمْ رُجُوعًا إِلَى أَمَاكِنَ لَا جُمُعَةَ عَلَى أَهْلِهَا

So, the Messenger of Allah ﷺ informed them through what is in these two hadiths that they are not required to remain in the place they came to for Eid prayer until Friday prayer time enters while they are there, so Friday prayer would become obligatory upon them as it is obligatory upon the people of that place, because it is a city from among the cities. He made it optional for them to remain there until they pray Friday prayer in it, or to depart from it to their places and abandon staying for Friday prayer, so their return to their places would be a return to places where Friday prayer is not obligatory upon their people.

فَقَالَ: فَقَدْ رَوَيْتُمْ أَيْضًا عَنْ النَّبِيِّ ﷺ فِي هَذَا الْمَعْنَى حَدِيثًا هُوَ أَعْجَبُ مِنْ هَذَا

He said: "You have also narrated from the Prophet ﷺ regarding this meaning a hadith that is more remarkable than this."

١١٥٥ - يَعْنِي مَا حَدَّثَنَا بِهِ مُحَمَّدُ بْنُ عَلِيٍّ بْنِ دَاوُدَ الْبَغْدَادِيُّ قَالَ: حَدَّثَنَا يَزِيدُ بْنُ عَبْدِ رَبِّهِ الْجُرْجُسِيُّ، قَالَ: حَدَّثَنَا: بِقِيَّةُ بْنُ الْوَلِيدِ، قَالَ: حَدَّثَنَا شُعْبَةُ، عَنْ مُعِيرَةَ، عَنْ عَبْدِ الْعَزِيزِ بْنِ رُقَيْعٍ، عَنْ أَبِي صَالِحٍ، عَنْ أَبِي هُرَيْرَةَ، قَالَ: «اجْتَمَعَ عِيدَانِ عَلَى عَهْدِ النَّبِيِّ ﷺ فِي يَوْمٍ، فَقَالَ النَّبِيُّ ﷺ: أَيُّمَا شِئْتُمْ أَجْرَأَكُمُ

1155 - Meaning what Muḥammad ibn 'Alī ibn Dāwūd al-Baghdādī narrated to us, he said: Yazīd ibn 'Abd Rabbih al-Jurjusī narrated to us, he said: Baqiyya ibn al-Walīd narrated to us, he said: Shu'ba narrated to us, from Mughīra, from 'Abd al-'Azīz ibn Rufay', from Abī Šāliḥ, from Abī Hurayra, he said: Two Eids occurred together during the time of the Prophet ﷺ on one day, so the Prophet ﷺ said: "Whichever one you wish will suffice you."ⁱⁱⁱ

قَالَ: فِي هَذَا الْحَدِيثِ رَدُّهُ الْمَشْبِيئَةَ إِلَيْهِمْ فِي الْإِثْنَانِ إِلَى صَلَاةِ الْعِيدِ وَتَرْكِ الْإِثْنَانِ لِمَا سِوَاهَا مِنْ صَلَاةِ الْجُمُعَةِ أَوْ
إِثْنَانِ الْجُمُعَةِ وَتَرْكِ مَا قَبْلَهَا مِنْ صَلَاةِ الْعِيدِ. [١٩١]

He said: In this hadith is his referral of the choice to them in coming to Eid prayer and abandoning coming to what is other than it from Friday prayer, or coming to Friday prayer and abandoning what comes before it from Eid prayer. [191]

فَكَانَ جَوَابِنَا لَهُ فِي ذَلِكَ بِتَوْفِيقِ اللَّهِ وَعَوْنِهِ أَنَّهُ قَدْ يُحْتَمَلُ أَنْ يَكُونَ النَّبِيُّ ﷺ خَاطَبَهُمْ بِذَلِكَ قَبْلَ يَوْمِ الْعِيدِ لِيَفْعَلُوهُ فِي يَوْمِ الْعِيدِ، وَأَعْلَمَ بِذَلِكَ أَهْلَ الْعَوَالِي أَنَّ لَهُمْ أَنْ يَتَخَلَّفُوا عَنْ صَلَاةِ الْعِيدِ وَيَحْضُرُوا لِصَلَاةِ الْجُمُعَةِ أَوْ يَحْضُرُوا لِصَلَاةِ الْعِيدِ فَيُصَلُّونَهَا ثُمَّ يَنْصَرِفُونَ إِلَى أَمَاكِنِهِمْ، وَلَا يَحْضُرُونَ الْجُمُعَةَ إِذَا كَانَ أَهْلُ تِلْكَ الْأَمَاكِنِ لَا جُمُعَةَ عَلَيْهِمْ لِأَنَّهُمْ لَيْسُوا بِمِصْرٍ مِنَ الْأَمْصَارِ ;

Our answer to him in this matter, by Allah's guidance and assistance, was that it is possible that the Prophet ﷺ addressed them with this before Eid day so they would do it on Eid day, and he informed the people of the highlands that they may stay away from Eid prayer and attend Friday prayer, or they may attend Eid prayer and pray it, then depart to their places and not attend Friday prayer if the people of those places do not have Friday prayer obligatory upon them, because they are not in a city from among the cities.

وَقَدْ رُوِيَ هَذَا الْحَدِيثُ بِالْأَفَاطِ هِيَ أَذَلُّ عَلَى هَذَا الْمَعْنَى مِنْ حَدِيثِ مُحَمَّدِ بْنِ عَلِيٍّ الَّذِي ذَكَرْنَا

This hadith has been narrated with wordings that are more indicative of this meaning than the hadith of Muḥammad ibn 'Alī that we mentioned.

١١٥٦ - كَمَا حَدَّثَنَا بَكَّارُ بْنُ قُنَيْبَةَ، قَالَ: حَدَّثَنَا أَبُو دَاوُدَ، وَأَبُو عَامِرٍ قَالَا: حَدَّثَنَا سُفْيَانُ، عَنْ عَبْدِ الْعَزِيزِ بْنِ رُفَيْعٍ عَنْ ذُكْوَانَ، قَالَ: اجْتَمَعَ عِيدَانِ عَلَى عَهْدِ النَّبِيِّ ﷺ فَقَالَ: «إِنَّكُمْ قَدْ أَصَبْتُمْ خَيْرًا وَذِكْرًا، وَإِنَّا مُجَمِّعُونَ فَمَنْ شَاءَ أَنْ يُجَمَعَ فَلْيُجَمَعْ وَمَنْ شَاءَ أَنْ يَرْجَعَ فَلْيَرْجَعْ»

1156 - As Bakkār ibn Qutayba narrated to us, he said: Abū Dāwūd and Abū 'Āmir narrated to us, they said: Sufyān narrated to us, from 'Abd al-'Azīz ibn Rufay', from Dhakwān, he said: Two Eids occurred together during the time of the Prophet ﷺ, so he said: "You have indeed attained good and remembrance [dhikr], and we are holding the Friday congregational prayer, so whoever wishes to attend the Friday congregational prayer, let him attend, and whoever wishes to return, let him return."

قَالَ أَبُو جَعْفَرٍ: فِي هَذَا الْحَدِيثِ كَشَفُ الْمَعْنَى الَّذِي ذَكَرْنَا [١٩٢] اِحْتِمَالِ الْحَدِيثِ الْأَوَّلِ إِبَاهُ

Abū Ja'far (al-Ṭahāwī) said: In this hadith is a clarification of the meaning that we mentioned [192] as a possible interpretation of the first hadith.

وَقَدْ رُوِيَ عَنْ عَثْمَانَ بْنِ عَفَّانَ رَضِيَ اللَّهُ عَنْهُ أَنَّ أَمْرَ أَهْلِ الْعَوَالِي بِمِثْلِ ذَلِكَ فِي يَوْمِ اجْتِمَاعِ فِيهِ عِيدَانِ مِنْ أَيَّامِهِ

It has been narrated from 'Uthmān ibn 'Affān, may Allah be pleased with him, that he had commanded the people of the highlands with something similar to this on a day when two Eids occurred together during his time.

كَمَا حَدَّثَنَا بَكَّارُ بْنُ قُتَيْبَةَ قَالَ: حَدَّثَنَا رَوْحُ بْنُ عُبَادَةَ قَالَ: حَدَّثَنَا مَالِكُ بْنُ أَنَسٍ قَالَ: أَخْبَرَنَا ابْنُ شِهَابٍ عَنْ أَبِي عُبَيْدٍ مَوْلَى ابْنِ أَزْهَرَ قَالَ: شَهِدْتُ الْعِيدَ مَعَ عَثْمَانَ فِي يَوْمِ الْجُمُعَةِ فَجَاءَ فَصَلَّى ثُمَّ انْصَرَفَ فَخَطَّ

، فَخَطَبَ فَقَالَ: «إِنَّهُ قَدْ اجْتَمَعَ لَكُمْ عِيدَانِ فِي يَوْمِكُمْ هَذَا، مَنْ أَحَبَّ مِنْ أَهْلِ الْعَالِيَةِ أَنْ يَنْتَظِرَ الْجُمُعَةَ فَلْيَنْتَظِرْهَا، وَمَنْ أَحَبَّ أَنْ يَرْجِعَ فَلْيَرْجِعْ فَقَدْ أُذِنْتُ لَهُ

As Bakkār ibn Qutayba narrated to us, he said: Rawḥ ibn 'Ubāda narrated to us, he said: Mālik ibn Anas narrated to us, he said: Ibn Shihāb informed us, from Abī 'Ubayd, the freed slave of Ibn Azhar, he said: I witnessed the Eid with 'Uthmān on Friday, so he came and prayed, then departed and delivered a sermon [khuṭba], and he said: "Two Eids have occurred together for you on this day of yours. Whoever among the people of the highlands wishes to wait for Friday prayer, let him wait for it, and whoever wishes to return, let him return, for I have given him permission."

وَكَمَا حَدَّثَنَا بَكَّارٌ قَالَ: حَدَّثَنَا إِبْرَاهِيمُ بْنُ أَبِي الْوَزِيرِ قَالَ: حَدَّثَنَا سُفْيَانُ بْنُ الزُّهْرِيِّ عَنْ أَبِي عُبَيْدٍ مَوْلَى ابْنِ أَزْهَرَ قَالَ: شَهِدْتُ الْعِيدَ مَعَ عَثْمَانَ بْنِ عَفَّانَ رَضِيَ اللَّهُ عَنْهُ فَوَافَقَ ذَلِكَ يَوْمَ الْجُمُعَةِ فَبَدَأَ بِالصَّلَاةِ قَبْلَ الْخُطْبَةِ، ثُمَّ قَالَ: «هَذَا يَوْمٌ قَدْ اجْتَمَعَ فِيهِ عِيدَانِ، مَنْ كَانَ هَاهُنَا [١٩٣] مِنْ أَهْلِ الْعَوَالِي فَقَدْ أُذِنَّا لَهُ، وَمَنْ أَحَبَّ أَنْ يَمْكُثَ فَلْيَمْكُثْ

And as Bakkār narrated to us, he said: Ibrāhīm ibn Abī al-Wazīr narrated to us, he said: Sufyān narrated to us, from al-Zuhrī, from Abī 'Ubayd, the freed slave of Ibn Azhar, he said: I witnessed the Eid with 'Uthmān ibn 'Affān, may Allah be pleased with him, and it coincided with Friday, so he began with the prayer before the sermon, then he said: "This is a day on which two Eids have occurred together for you. Whoever is here [193] from among the

people of the highlands, we have given him permission, and whoever wishes to remain, let him remain."

وَفِيمَا ذَكَرْنَا بَيَانٌ لِّمَا ذَكَرْنَا مِمَّا قَدْ تَقَدَّمَ وَصَفْنَا لَهُ فِي احْتِمَالٍ مَا قَدْ رَوَيْنَاهُ عَنْ رَسُولِ اللَّهِ ﷺ فِي هَذَا الْبَابِ . وَاللَّهُ نَسْأَلُهُ التَّوْفِيقَ

In what we have mentioned is a clarification of what we mentioned regarding what we previously described in our interpretation of what we have narrated from the Messenger of Allah ﷺ in this chapter. We ask Allah for success.

Al-Kawtharī on Eid Salah coinciding with Jumu'a

He mentioned the following in his Maqālāt (pp. 258–261):

A noble visitor came to me yesterday, requesting that I write something about whether Friday prayer is waived for one who has prayed the Eid prayer on Friday, or whether it is not waived. I said: This question has passed its time. He said: No, rather I beseech you earnestly in supplication that you write what would satisfy regarding this matter, because many of those who work in destruction without building anything from the religion have made it their habit to confuse the common people by confronting them with what contradicts what has been inherited among them regarding matters of belief and practice - for reasons known to Allah - persisting in speaking about that issue in many gatherings and clubs from the day of Eid al-Adha until today. This might lead to casting doubt on all inherited jurisprudence [fiqh] if the people of expertise remain silent about clarifying the truth whenever someone dares to challenge the followed jurisprudence [fiqh] passed down from predecessors to successors. So I said to him: Take this matter lightly, and this issue is not among the dangerous issues relative to the anomalous issues that we face from time to time. Nevertheless, I will write something about it in compliance with your desire, so I say, seeking help from Allah:

Indeed, the statement that Eid prayer suffices for Friday prayer and is adequate in place of Friday prayer is an anomalous opinion attributed to Imam Ahmad ibn Ḥanbal among the followed Imams - may Allah be pleased with them - but since the codification of his jurisprudential school [madhhab] was not under his supervision - unlike the schools [madhāhib] of the other Imams - the narrations from him multiplied, as you can find confirmation of this in (al-Ri'āyah al-Kubrā) by Ibn Ḥamdān and (al-Furū') by Ibn Muflīḥ, until the sifting of narrations from him became extremely difficult, and it became problematic to rely on the correctness of attributing an opinion contrary to the opinion of the majority to him. Therefore, you see Ibn Jarīr and others who wrote about disagreements generally do not mention his disagreement, rather his school [madhhab] did not spread outside Iraq as a jurisprudential school [madhhab fiqhī] except in the middle of the fifth century through Abū Ya'lā al-Qāḍī and his companions. Imam Ilkiyā al-Harāsī al-Shāfi'ī, the well-known, compiled a book containing about one hundred issues from his unique positions, which stirred the ire of the Ḥanbalīs until they compiled responses to him.

As for our issue, Abū Ḥanīfa and his companions, Mālik and his companions, al-Shāfi'ī and his companions, even the Zāhirīs, have all agreed that Eid prayer does not waive Friday prayer at all.

After this preamble, I say: If the questioner is a common person, then he has no school [madhhab] other than what the scholar he consulted gives him as a legal opinion [fatwā], trusting in his religion and knowledge, being scrupulous and not following desires. This scholar is bound by the texts of his school [madhhab] if he is not among the people of independent reasoning [ijtihād]. In Egypt - may Allah Most High protect it - where there is no recognized school [madhhab] followed by the Muslim Egyptian people other than the schools [madhāhib] of Abū Ḥanīfa, Mālik, and al-Shāfi'ī - may Allah be pleased with them - it is not permissible for a scholar of that type to give a legal opinion [fatwā] to a non-Ḥanbalī questioner there with an opinion considered anomalous by the majority merely because he finds it recorded in some books, especially regarding concessions [rukhaṣ], because that would be following desires, not worship. But if the scholar giving the legal opinion [fatwā] is one who feels independent reasoning [ijtihād] within himself, then it is not permissible for him to give a legal opinion [fatwā] about anything without establishing a strong proof in the

matter, receiving responses with an open heart. So, our discussion of the issue is with two groups: the group of imitators [muqallida], followers of the followed Imams - may Allah be pleased with them - and the group that aspires to independent reasoning [ijtihād].

The first group, since it is satisfied with the texts of the Imams, it suffices for us here to enumerate from the texts of the Imams of independent reasoning [a'immāt al-ijtihād] in the matter what contains sufficient communication, so we say:

Imam Muḥammad ibn al-Ḥasan al-Shaybānī said in (al-Jāmi' al-Ṣaghīrⁱⁱⁱ): Muḥammad from Ya'qūb from Abū Ḥanīfa: **Two celebrations came together on one day, so the first is a recommended act [sunna] and the other is an obligation [farīḍa], and neither of them should be abandoned - meaning the Eid and Friday.**

And in (al-Muwatṭa')^{iv} of Imam Muḥammad also, from Imam Mālik ibn Anas from Muḥammad ibn Shihāb al-Zuhrī from Abū 'Ubayd, the freed slave of Ibn Azhar, that he said in his narration: (I witnessed the Eid with 'Uthmān ibn 'Affān - may Allah be pleased with him - so he prayed then departed, then gave a sermon and said: Indeed, two celebrations have come together for you on this day of yours, so whoever among the people of al-'Āliyah wishes to wait for Friday, let him wait for it, and whoever wishes to return, let him return, for I have given him permission). Then Muḥammad^v said: (And by all of this we take, and 'Uthmān only gave permission regarding Friday to the people of al-'Āliyah because they are not among the people of the city [miṣr], and this is the opinion of Abū Ḥanīfa).^{vi}

And al-'Āliyah is miles away from Madina. Al-Bukhārī recorded this narration [ḥadīth] in his authentic collection [Ṣaḥīḥ]^{vii} in the chapter on sacrifices, as did Yaḥyā al-Laythī in (al-Muwatṭa')^{viii}.

Abū al-Walīd al-Bājī al-Mālikī said in his commentary^{ix}: (Ibn Wahb, Muṭarrif, and Ibn al-Mājjishūn narrated from Mālik that this - meaning the permission for the people of the highlands and villages - is permissible... And by this Abū Ḥanīfa and al-Shāfi'ī^x said).

Al-Shāfi'ī said in (al-Umm^{xi}): (And if the day of Fitr is a Friday, the Imam prays the Eid when the prayer becomes permissible, then gives permission to those present who are not among the people of the city [miṣr] to depart if they wish to their families and not return for Friday, and the choice for them is to stay until they attend Friday prayer or to return after their departure if they are able until they attend Friday prayer, and if they do not do so, there is no blame, Allah willing. This is not permissible for anyone among the people of the city [miṣr] except for one with an excuse). Then he said (And likewise if it is the day of Sacrifice, it does not differ if it is in a town where Friday is held and Eid is prayed, and the people of Minā do not pray the (Eid al-) Adha prayer nor Friday prayer because it is not a city [miṣr]).

Al-Badr al-'Aynī said in (al-Bināya Sharḥ al-Hidāya)^{xii}: (Ibn 'Abd al-Barr said: The waiving of Friday (prayer) and Zuhr by Eid prayer is abandoned and forsaken, not to be relied upon).

Ibn Ḥazm said in al-Muḥallā^{xiii}: (And if Eid and Friday come together, one prays for Eid then for Friday necessarily, and no authentic report [athar] contradicts this... Abū Muḥammad (Ibn Ḥazm) said: Friday is an obligation [farḍ] and Eid is voluntary [taṭawwu'], and the voluntary does not waive the obligatory) - end quote.

And by this, the school [madhhab] of the three Imams and their companions and the school [madhhab] of the Zāhirīs became apparent, and their evidence is the Book and the widely transmitted Sunna and inherited practice and consensus [ijmā'] regarding the obligation of Friday prayer upon the people of cities [amṣār] among men who are not excused as a general obligation. So, it is inconceivable to exclude one who prays Eid from this ruling except by the establishment of evidence equal to it in strength, and short of that is stringing thorns, as the great muḥaddith (Hadith scholar) al-Tahānawī says in the eighth volume of his book (I'lā' al-Sunan)^{xiv}, and in it is a comprehensive examination of this research from every angle.

What is attributed in some books to 'Aṭā' regarding waiving Friday prayer and Ṣuḥr for one who prayed Eid on a day when Eid and Friday prayer came together is an error in its narration due to Ibn al-Zubayr not going out after Eid prayer until afternoon ['aṣr], and Allah forbid that he would say to waive Friday prayer, let alone Ṣuḥr, thus dropping one prayer from the five prayers.^{xv}

As for what is narrated about Ibn al-Zubayr, we will discuss it soon, Allah willing. There is no blame on a Ḥanbalī who is not familiar with the evidence of the issue if he follows the opinion recorded in Ḥanbalī books regarding the issue that Friday is a collective obligation [farḍ kifāya] after performing Eid prayer without Ṣuḥr being waived for one who did not pray Friday, and this is also the school [madhhab] of Zayd ibn 'Alī - may Allah be pleased with him. Allah forbid that it would be from the school [madhhab] of Zayd or Aḥmad to waive the obligation [farḍ] of Ṣuḥr for one who prayed Eid.

Abū Bakr ibn al-'Arabī^{xvi} said: The narration [ḥadīth] of Abū Hurayra from Abū Dāwūd and the narration [ḥadīth] of Zayd ibn Arqam from him as well do not contain the Imam abandoning Friday - as is reported about Ibn al-Zubayr - but rather they contain the concession for one who has a distant residence. End quote.

So, the possessor of proof cannot turn away from restricting the concession to the people of villages, and al-Ṭaḥāwī proceeded upon this in (Mushkil al-Āthār) following the proofs. However, the Ḥanbalī imitator [muqallid] is excused in following what is recorded in the books of his school [madhhab], even if the issue is weak from the standpoint of proof, as is the ruling for one who imitates the followed Imams, unlike one who is familiar with the evidence of rulings, for it is not permissible for him to deviate from what the clear-landmark proof requires.

So, it becomes apparent that Eid prayer does not avail even a thread's worth in place of Friday prayer, and the permission to absent oneself from Friday is only with regard to the people of villages and desert areas according to the three Imams and their companions and the majority of jurists [fuqahā] - may Allah be pleased with them. Abū Dāwūd, despite his recording of

those narrations [aḥādīth], did not attribute the issue to Aḥmad in his questions [masā'il] nor to Ishāq ibn Maṣṣūr. Nevertheless, the imitators [muqallida] of the Ḥanbalī or Zaydī school [madhhab] are excused in following the opinion recorded in the two schools regarding the issue, even though it is weak in foundation and refuted in proof, because the evidence of the imitator [muqallid] is the saying of his Imam, so he is not bound by proof, unlike one who has familiarity with the evidence of rulings, for he cannot afford to contradict the apparent [zāhira] proof. The proof in the matter has become apparent, so praise be to Allah for granting success and guidance. End of quotes.

Further quotes:

Imām al-Ṭaḥāwī has been quoted by Imām Abū Bakr al-Jaṣṣāṣ (d. 370 AH) as saying the following in his Mukhtaṣar Ikhtilāf al-'Ulamā' (1/346):

فِي الْعِيدَيْنِ يَجْتَمِعَانِ هَلْ يَجْزِيءُ أَحَدُهُمَا عَنِ الْآخَرِ

Regarding the Two Eids When They Coincide - Does One Suffice for the Other?

قَالَ أَصْحَابُنَا الْأَوَّلُ سَنَةَ وَالْآخَرَ فَرَضَ يَشْهَدُهُمَا وَلَا يَجْزِيءُ أَحَدُهُمَا عَنِ الْآخَرِ وَهُوَ قَوْلُ مَالِكٍ

“Our companions (Hanafis) said: The first is Sunna and the other is an obligation (fard). He attends both and one does not suffice for the other. This is the position of Mālik.”

In al-Mudawwanah al-Kubrā of **al-Qāḍī Saḥnūn al-Tanūkhī** (d. 240 AH) it mentioned the following from Imam Mālik ibn Anas (d. 179 AH):

قُلْتُ: مَا قَوْلُ مَالِكٍ إِذَا اجْتَمَعَ الْأَضْحَى وَالْجُمُعَةُ أَوْ الْفِطْرُ أَوْ الْجُمُعَةُ فَصَلَّى رَجُلٌ مِنْ أَهْلِ الْحَضَرِ الْعِيدَ مَعَ الْإِمَامِ ثُمَّ أَرَادَ أَنْ لَا يَشْهَدَ الْجُمُعَةَ، هَلْ يَضَعُ ذَلِكَ عَنْهُ شُهُودُهُ صَلَاةَ الْعِيدِ مَا وَجَبَ عَلَيْهِ مِنْ اثْنَانِ الْجُمُعَةَ؟

I said: What is Mālik's position when (Eid) al-Aḥḥā and Friday coincide, or (Eid al) Fiṭr and Friday, and a man from the city dwellers prays the Eid with

the Imam then wants not to attend Friday [prayer] - does his attendance at Eid prayer exempt him from what is obligatory upon him of attending Friday [prayer]?

قَالَ: لَا وَكَانَ يَقُولُ: لَا يَضَعُ ذَلِكَ عَنْهُ مَا وَجِبَ عَلَيْهِ مِنْ إِتْيَانِ الْجُمُعَةِ، قَالَ مَالِكٌ: وَلَمْ يَبْلُغْنِي أَنَّ أَحَدًا أَدْنَى لِأَهْلِ الْعَوَالِي إِلَّا عُثْمَانَ، وَلَمْ يَكُنْ مَالِكٌ يَرَى الَّذِي فَعَلَ عُثْمَانُ، وَكَانَ يَرَى: إِنَّ مَنْ وَجِبَتْ عَلَيْهِ الْجُمُعَةُ لَا يَضَعُهَا عَنْهُ إِذْنُ الْإِمَامِ وَإِنْ شَهِدَ مَعَ الْإِمَامِ قَبْلَ ذَلِكَ مِنْ يَوْمِهِ ذَلِكَ عِيدًا وَبَلَّغْنِي ذَلِكَ عَنْ مَالِكٍ.

He said: No, and he used to say: That does not exempt him from what is obligatory upon him of attending Friday [prayer]. Mālik said: It has not reached me that anyone gave permission to the people of al-‘Awālī except ‘Uthmān, and Mālik did not approve of what ‘Uthmān did, and he held the view that whoever has Friday [prayer] as an obligation upon him, the imam's permission does not exempt him from it, even if he attended an Eid with the imam before that on that same day. This reached me from Mālik.

The Maliki scholar known as **Abū Bakr al-Ṣiqillī** (d. 451 AH) mentioned the following in his al-Jāmi‘ li-Masā’il al-Mudawwana (3/863):

ومن المدونة/ قال مالك: ومن شهد العيد يوم الجمعة مع الإمام فلا يسقط شهود العيد إتيان الجمعة، وإن أذن له الإمام، ولم يأخذ مالك بإذن عثمان لأهل العوالي، وقال: ما بلغني عن غيره

From the Mudawwana/ Mālik said: Whoever attends the Eid on a Friday with the Imam, attending the Eid does not exempt him from coming to Friday [prayer], even if the Imam gives him permission. Mālik did not take [the position based on] ‘Uthmān's permission to the people of al-‘Awālī, and he said: "Nothing has reached me from anyone else [regarding this matter]."

وجاء في المعونة على مذهب عالم المدينة الإمام مالك بن أنس للقاضي أبي محمد عبد الوهاب بن علي بن نصر الثعلبي البغدادي المالكي، كتاب الصلاة، باب صلاة الجمعة، فصل إذا اتفق عيد وجمعة

It came in al-Ma'ūnah 'alā Madhhab 'Ālim al-Madīnah al-Imām Mālik ibn Anas by the Judge **Abū Muḥammad 'Abd al-Wahhāb ibn 'Alī ibn Naṣr al-Tha'labī al-Baghdādī al-Mālikī (d. 422 AH)**, Book of Prayer, Chapter of Friday Prayer, Section: When an Eid and Friday Coincide

إذا اتفق عيد وجمعة لم يُسقط أحدهما الآخر خلافاً لمن قال: إن حضور العيد يكفي عن الجمعة؛ لقوله تعالى: ﴿إِذَا تُوذِيَ لِلصَّلَاةِ مِنْ يَوْمِ الْجُمُعَةِ فَاسْعَوْا إِلَىٰ ذِكْرِ اللَّهِ﴾ [الجمعة: 9]، وقوله صلى الله عليه وسلم: «الجمعة على كل مسلم»، ولأن شرائط الجمعة موجودة، فلزم أداؤها، أصله إذا لم يكن يوم عيد؛ لأن صلاة العيد سنة فلم تُسقط فرضاً أصله الكسوف، ولأن الجمعة أكد من العيد؛ لأنها فرض، فإذا لم يسقط الأضعف كان الأضعف أولى بالألّا (يُسقط الأكبر)

(When an Eid and Friday coincide, one does not drop the other, contrary to whoever said that attending the Eid suffices for Friday; because of His saying, the Exalted: "When the call is made for prayer on Friday, then hasten to the remembrance of Allah" [al-Jumu'ah: 9], and his saying, peace and blessings be upon him: "Friday [prayer] is upon every Muslim," and because the conditions of Friday are present, so performing it becomes necessary, based on the principle when it is not an Eid day; because Eid prayer is a sunnah so it does not drop an obligation, based on the principle of eclipse [prayer], and because Friday is more emphasized than Eid because it is an obligation, so if the weaker one does not drop [the stronger], then the weaker is more fitting not to drop the greater).

المعونة على مذهب عالم المدينة «الإمام مالك بن أنس»، أبو محمد عبدالوهاب بن علي بن نصر الثعلبي «(2/ 299) البغدادي المالكي،

"al-Ma'ūnah 'alā Madhhab 'Ālim al-Madīnah 'al-Imām Mālik ibn Anas'," Abū Muḥammad 'Abd al-Wahhāb ibn 'Alī ibn Naṣr al-Tha'labī al-Baghdādī al-Mālikī, (2/ 299)."

وجاء عن الإمام الخطيب الشربيني قوله: «ولو وافق العيد يوم جمعة فحضر أهل القرية الذين يبلغهم النداء لصلاة العيد ولو رجعوا إلى أهلهم فاتتهم الجمعة، فلهم الرجوع وترك الجمعة يومئذ على الأصح، فتستثنى هذه من إطلاق المُصَيَّف، نعم لو دخل وقتها قبل انصرافهم كأن دخل عقب سلامهم من العيد، فالظاهر كما قال (1/ 539) شيخنا: إنه ليس لهم تركها»؛ «مغني المحتاج، الخطيب الشربيني،

Imam al-Khaṭīb al-Shirbīnī (d. 977 AH) said: "If Eid coincides with Friday and the people of the village who are reached by the call come to Eid prayer, and if they returned to their families they would miss Friday [prayer], then they may return and abandon Friday [prayer] that day according to the most correct [aṣaḥḥ] position. This is excepted from the author's absolute statement. However, if its time enters before their departure - such as if it enters immediately after their salām from Eid - then the apparent [position], as our teacher said, is that they may not abandon it." Mughnī al-Muḥtāj, al-Khaṭīb al-Shirbīnī (1/539).

وقال الإمام الشافعي: وإذا كان يوم الفطر يوم الجمعة صلّى الإمام العيد حين تحل الصلاة، ثم أذن لمن حضره من غير أهل المصر أن ينصرفوا إن شاءوا إلى أهلهم، ولا يعودون إلى الجمعة، والاختيار لهم أن يقيموا حتى يجمعوا، أو يعودوا بعد انصرافهم إن قدروا حتى يجمعوا، وإن لم يفعلوا فلا حرج إن شاء الله تعالى؛ «الأم، (1/ 274) للشافعي».

Imam al-Shāfi'ī (d. 204 AH) said: "When the day of Fiṭr is a Friday, the Imam prays Eid when prayer becomes permissible, then gives permission to those who attended from other than the people of the city [miṣr] to depart if they wish to their families, and they do not return to Friday [prayer]. The preferable choice for them is to remain until they hold Friday [prayer], or to return after their departure if they are able until they hold Friday [prayer]. If they do not do so, there is no sin, if Allāh the Exalted wills." al-Umm, by al-Shāfi'ī (1/274).

Conclusion:

Based on the extensive scholarly analysis presented in this compilation, it is clear that the vast majority of Sunni madhhabs do not grant a concession to abandon Friday prayer when Eid falls on a Friday particularly for city dwellers, with the exception of the Ḥanbalī school.

End notes:

ⁱ 3/186-192, see - <https://app.turath.io/book/22547?page=1150>)

ⁱⁱ This narration via the route of Baqiyya ibn al-Walīd was analysed by **Imam Abū 'Umar ibn 'Abd al-Barr** (d. 463 AH) in his *al-Tamhīd* (10/270, see here - <https://app.turath.io/book/1719?page=3517>) as part of a lengthy discussion as follows:

قَالَ أَبُو عُمَرَ لَيْسَ فِي حَدِيثِ ابْنِ الزُّبَيْرِ بَيَانٌ أَنَّهُ صَلَّى مَعَ صَلَاةِ الْعِيدِ رَكْعَتَيْنِ لِلْجُمُعَةِ وَأَيُّ الْأَمْرَيْنِ كَانَ فَإِنَّ ذَلِكَ أَمْرٌ مَثْرُوكٌ مَهْجُورٌ وَإِنْ كَانَ لَمْ يُصَلِّ مَعَ صَلَاةِ الْعِيدِ غَيْرَهَا حَتَّى الْعَصْرِ فَإِنَّ الْأَصُولَ كُلَّهَا تَشْهَدُ بِفَسَادِ هَذَا الْقَوْلِ لِأَنَّ الْفَرْضَيْنِ إِذَا اجْتَمَعَا فِي فَرَضٍ وَاحِدٍ لَمْ يَسْقُطْ أَحَدُهُمَا بِالْآخَرِ فَكَيْفَ أَنْ يَسْقُطَ فَرَضٌ لِسُنَّةٍ حَضَرَتْ فِي يَوْمِهِ هَذَا مَا لَا يَشْكُ فِي فُسَادِهِ ذُو فَهْمٍ

Abū 'Umar said: There is no clarification in the hadith of Ibn al-Zubayr that he prayed two units [rak'atayn] for Friday prayer along with the Eid prayer. Whichever of the two matters it was, that is an abandoned and forsaken practice. If he did not pray anything with the Eid prayer until the afternoon prayer [ʿAṣr], then all the fundamental principles [uṣūl] testify to the corruption of this position, because when two obligations coincide on a single obligation, one does not drop the other. How then could an obligation (fard) drop for a recommended practice [sunna] that occurs on its day? This is something whose corruption no person of understanding doubts.

وَإِنْ كَانَ صَلَّى مَعَ صَلَاةِ الْفِطْرِ رَكْعَتَيْنِ لِلْجُمُعَةِ فَقَدْ صَلَّى الْجُمُعَةَ فِي غَيْرِ وَقْتِهَا عِنْدَ أَكْثَرِ النَّاسِ إِلَّا أَنْ هَذَا مَوْضِعٌ قَدْ اخْتَلَفَ فِيهِ السَّلَفُ فَذَهَبَ قَوْمٌ إِلَى أَنْ وَقْتُ الْجُمُعَةِ صَدْرُ النَّهَارِ وَأَنَّهَا صَلَاةُ عِيدٍ وَقَدْ مَضَى الْقَوْلُ فِي ذَلِكَ فِي بَابِ ابْنِ شِهَابٍ عَنِ عُرْوَةَ وَذَهَبَ الْجُمْهُورُ إِلَى أَنْ وَقْتُ الْجُمُعَةِ وَقْتُ الظُّهْرِ وَعَلَى هَذَا فَفَقَاءُ الْأَمْصَارِ

If he prayed two units for Friday prayer along with the Eid al-Fiṭr prayer, then he prayed Friday prayer at other than its proper time according to most people. However, this is a matter in which the early generations [salaf] differed. Some people held that the time for Friday prayer is the early part of the day and that it is a festival prayer [ṣalāt ʿīd]. The discussion of this has already passed in the chapter of Ibn Shihāb from 'Urwa. The majority held that the time for Friday prayer is the time for midday prayer [zuhr], and this is the position of the jurists [fuqahā'] of the major cities [amṣār].

وَأَمَّا الْقَوْلُ الْأَوَّلُ إِنَّ الْجُمُعَةَ تَسْقُطُ بِالْعِيدِ وَلَا تُصَلَّى ظَهْرًا وَلَا جُمُعَةً فَقَوْلٌ بَيِّنٌ الْقَسَادِ وَظَاهِرٌ الْخَطَأِ مَثْرُوكٌ مَهْجُورٌ لَا يُعْرَجُ عَلَيْهِ لِأَنَّ اللَّهَ عَزَّ وَجَلَّ يَقُولُ إِذَا نُودِيَ لِلصَّلَاةِ مِنْ يَوْمِ الْجُمُعَةِ وَلَمْ يُخْصَ يَوْمٌ عِيدٍ مِنْ غَيْرِهِ

As for the first position - that Friday prayer is dropped by the Eid and neither midday prayer [zuhr] nor Friday prayer is prayed - this is a position of clear corruption and apparent error, abandoned and forsaken, not to be given consideration, because Allāh (Mighty and Majestic) says: "When the call is made for prayer on the day of Friday" and He did not specify an Eid day from others.

وَأَمَّا الْأَثَارُ الْمَرْفُوعَةُ فِي ذَلِكَ فَلَيْسَ فِيهَا بَيَانٌ سَقُوطِ الْجُمُعَةِ وَالظُّهْرِ وَلَكِنْ فِيهَا الرُّخْصَةُ فِي التَّخَلُّفِ عَنْ شَهَادَةِ الْجُمُعَةِ وَهَذَا مَحْمُولٌ عِنْدَ أَهْلِ الْعِلْمِ عَلَى وَجْهَيْنِ أَحَدُهُمَا أَنْ تَسْقُطَ الْجُمُعَةُ عَنْ أَهْلِ الْمِصْرِ وَغَيْرِهِمْ وَيُصَلُّونَ

ظَهْرًا وَالْآخَرَ أَنَّ الرُّخْصَةَ إِنَّمَا وَرَدَتْ فِي ذَلِكَ لِأَهْلِ الْبَادِيَةِ وَمَنْ لَا تَجِبُ عَلَيْهِ الْجُمُعَةُ وَسَتَذَكُرُ اخْتِلَافَ النَّاسِ فِي ذَلِكَ وَفِي مَنْ تَجِبُ عَلَيْهِ الْجُمُعَةُ فِي هَذَا الْبَابِ إِنْ شَاءَ اللَّهُ تَعَالَى

As for the transmitted reports [āthār] concerning this matter, there is no clarification in them of the dropping of Friday prayer and midday prayer [ẓuhr], but rather they contain a dispensation [rukḥṣa] for absenting oneself from attending Friday prayer. This is interpreted by the people of knowledge in two ways: one is that Friday prayer drops for the people of the city and others, and they pray midday prayer [ẓuhr]; and the other is that the dispensation [rukḥṣa] was granted only for the Bedouins and those upon whom Friday prayer is not obligatory. We shall mention the disagreement of people concerning this and concerning those upon whom Friday prayer is obligatory in this chapter, if Allāh the Exalted wills.

حَدَّثَنَا عَبْدُ اللَّهِ بْنُ مُحَمَّدٍ قَالَ حَدَّثَنَا مُحَمَّدُ بْنُ بَكْرٍ قَالَ حَدَّثَنَا أَبُو دَاوُدَ قَالَ حَدَّثَنَا مُحَمَّدُ بْنُ الْمُصَفَّى وَعُمَرُ بْنُ حَفْصِ الرُّصَافِيِّ قَالَا حَدَّثَنَا بَقِيَّةُ قَالَ حَدَّثَنَا شُعْبَةُ

‘Abd Allāh ibn Muḥammad narrated to us, he said: Muḥammad ibn Bakr narrated to us, he said: Abū Dāwūd narrated to us, he said: Muḥammad ibn al-Muṣaffā and ‘Umar ibn Ḥaḥṣ al-Ruṣāfi narrated to us, they said: Baqiyya narrated to us, he said: Shu‘ba narrated to us.

وَحَدَّثَنَا عَبْدُ الْوَارِثِ بْنُ سُفْيَانَ قَالَ حَدَّثَنَا قَاسِمُ بْنُ أَصْبَغٍ قَالَ حَدَّثَنَا مُحَمَّدُ بْنُ وَصَّاحٍ قَالَ حَدَّثَنَا ابْنُ الْمُصَفَّى قَالَ حَدَّثَنَا بَقِيَّةُ قَالَ حَدَّثَنَا شُعْبَةُ قَالَ حَدَّثَنِي الْمُغِيرَةُ الْبَصْرِيُّ عَنْ عَبْدِ الْعَزِيزِ بْنِ رُقَيْعٍ عَنْ أَبِي صَالِحٍ عَنْ أَبِي هُرَيْرَةَ عَنْ رَسُولِ اللَّهِ ﷺ أَنَّهُ (قَالَ قَدْ اجْتَمَعَ فِي يَوْمِكُمْ هَذَا عِيدَانِ فَمَنْ شَاءَ أَجْرَأْتَهُ الْجُمُعَةَ وَإِنَّا مُجْمِعُونَ إِنْ شَاءَ اللَّهُ

‘Abd al-Wārith ibn Sufyān narrated to us, he said: Qāsim ibn Aṣḥbagh narrated to us, he said: Muḥammad ibn Waḍḍāḥ narrated to us, he said: Ibn al-Muṣaffā narrated to us, he said: Baqiyya narrated to us, he said: Shu‘ba narrated to us, he said: al-Mughīra al-Baṣrī narrated to me from ‘Abd al-‘Azīz ibn Rufay‘ from Abī Ṣāliḥ from Abu Hurayra from the Messenger of Allāh ﷺ that he said: "Two festivals have coincided on this day of yours. Whoever wishes, Friday suffices him, and we are holding [Friday prayer], if Allāh wills."

قَالَ أَبُو عَمَرَ احْتَجَّ مَنْ ذَهَبَ مَذْهَبَ عَطَاءٍ فِي هَذِهِ الْمَسْأَلَةِ بِهَذَا الْحَدِيثِ لِمَا فِيهِ مِنْ قَوْلِهِ ﷺ إِنْ شِئْتُمْ أَجْرَأَكُمُ فَمَنْ شَاءَ أَجْرَأْتَهُ وَهَذَا الْحَدِيثُ لَمْ يَرَوْهُ فِيمَا عَلِمْتُ عَنْ شُعْبَةَ أَحَدٍ مِنْ ثِقَاتِ أَصْحَابِهِ الْحُقَاطِ وَإِنَّمَا رَوَاهُ عَنْهُ بَقِيَّةُ بْنُ الْوَلِيدِ وَلَيْسَ بِشَيْءٍ فِي شُعْبَةَ أَصْلًا وَرَوَاتُهُ عَنْ أَهْلِ بَلَدِهِ أَهْلَ الشَّامِ فِيهَا كَلَامٌ وَأَكْثَرُ أَهْلِ الْعِلْمِ يُضَعِّفُونَ بَقِيَّةَ عَنْ الشَّامِيِّينَ وَغَيْرِهِمْ وَلَهُ مَنَاقِبٌ وَهُوَ ضَعِيفٌ لَيْسَ مِمَّنْ يُحْتَجُّ بِهِ

Abū ‘Umar said: Those who followed ‘Aṭā’s position in this matter used this hadith as evidence because of what it contains of his ﷺ saying "If you wish, it suffices you" - "whoever wishes, it suffices him." This hadith, as far as I know, was not narrated from Shu‘ba by any of his trustworthy companions who were memorizers [ḥuffāz]. Rather, it was narrated from him by **Baqiyya ibn al-Walīd**, who is nothing concerning Shu‘ba at all. His narration from the people of his land, the people of Syria, is disputed, and most people of knowledge weaken Baqiyya regarding Syrians and others. He has objectionable reports [manākīr] and is weak [ḍa‘īf], not one who can be used as evidence.

وَقَدْ رَوَاهُ الثَّوْرِيُّ عَنْ عَبْدِ الْعَزِيزِ بْنِ رُفَيْعٍ عَنْ أَبِي صَالِحٍ مُرْسَلًا قَالَ اجْتَمَعَ عِيدَانِ عَلَى عَهْدِ رَسُولِ اللَّهِ ﷺ فَقَالَ إِنَّا مُجْمِعُونَ فَمَنْ شَاءَ مِنْكُمْ أَنْ يَجْمَعَ فَلْيَجْمَعْ وَمَنْ شَاءَ أَنْ يَرْجِعَ فَلْيَرْجِعْ فَأَقْتَصَرَ فِي هَذَا الْحَدِيثِ عَلَى ذِكْرِ إِبَاحَةِ الرَّجُوعِ وَلَمْ يَذْكَرِ الْإِجْرَاءَ

Al-Thawrī narrated it from ‘Abd al-‘Azīz ibn Rufay’ from Abu Ṣāliḥ as a disconnected report [mursal]. He said: "Two festivals coincided during the time of the Messenger of Allāh ﷺ, so he said: 'We are holding [Friday prayer]. Whoever among you wishes to attend Friday, let him attend, and whoever wishes to return, let him return.'" He confined himself in this hadith to mentioning the permissibility of returning and did not mention sufficiency [ijzā’].

وَرَوَاهُ زِيَادُ الْبُكَائِيُّ عَنْ عَبْدِ الْعَزِيزِ بْنِ رُفَيْعٍ بِمَعْنَى حَدِيثِ الثَّوْرِيِّ إِلَّا أَنَّهُ أَسْنَدَهُ حَدَّثَنِي عَبْدُ الْوَارِثِ بْنُ سُفْيَانَ قَالَ حَدَّثَنَا قَاسِمُ بْنُ أَصْبَغٍ قَالَ حَدَّثَنَا إِبْرَاهِيمُ بْنُ إِسْحَاقَ النَّيْسَابُورِيُّ قَالَ حَدَّثَنَا إِبْرَاهِيمُ بْنُ دِينَارٍ قَالَ حَدَّثَنَا زِيَادُ بْنُ عَبْدِ اللَّهِ بْنِ الطَّفِيلِ الْبُكَائِيُّ قَالَ حَدَّثَنَا عَبْدُ الْعَزِيزِ بْنِ رُفَيْعٍ عَنْ أَبِي صَالِحٍ عَنْ أَبِي هُرَيْرَةَ قَالَ اجْتَمَعْنَا إِلَى رَسُولِ اللَّهِ ﷺ فِي يَوْمِ عِيدٍ وَيَوْمِ جُمُعَةٍ فَقَالَ لَنَا رَسُولُ اللَّهِ ﷺ وَهُوَ فِي الْعِيدِ هَذَا يَوْمٌ قَدْ اجْتَمَعَ لَكُمْ فِيهِ عِيدَانِ عِيدَكُمْ هَذَا وَالْجُمُعَةُ وَإِنِّي مُجْمِعٌ إِذَا رَجَعْتُ فَمَنْ أَحَبَّ مِنْكُمْ أَنْ يَشْهَدَ الْجُمُعَةَ فَلْيَشْهَدْهَا قَالَ فَلَمَّا رَجَعَ رَسُولُ اللَّهِ ﷺ جَمَعَ بِالنَّاسِ

Ziyād al-Bakkā’ī narrated it from ‘Abd al-‘Azīz ibn Rufay’ with the same meaning as al-Thawrī’s hadith, except that he connected it with a chain of transmission: ‘Abd al-Wārith ibn Sufyān narrated to me, he said: Qāsim ibn Aṣḥbagh narrated to us, he said: Ibrāhīm ibn Ishāq al-Naysābūrī narrated to us, he said: Ibrāhīm ibn Dīnār narrated to us, he said: Ziyād ibn ‘Abd Allāh ibn al-Ṭufayl al-Bakkā’ī narrated to us, he said: ‘Abd al-‘Azīz ibn Rufay’ narrated to us from Abu Ṣāliḥ from Abī Hurayra. He said: "We gathered with the Messenger of Allāh ﷺ on a day that was both an Eid day and a Friday. The Messenger of Allāh ﷺ said to us while at the Eid: 'This is a day on which two festivals have coincided for you - this festival of yours and Friday. I will hold [Friday prayer] when I return. Whoever among you wishes to attend Friday, let him attend it.'" He said: "When the Messenger of Allāh ﷺ returned, he held Friday prayer with the people."

فَقَدْ بَانَ فِي هَذِهِ الرَّوَايَةِ وَرَوَايَةِ الثَّوْرِيِّ لِهَذَا الْحَدِيثِ أَنَّ رَسُولَ اللَّهِ ﷺ جَمَعَ ذَلِكَ الْيَوْمَ بِالنَّاسِ وَفِي ذَلِكَ دَلِيلٌ عَلَى أَنَّ فَرَضَ الْجُمُعَةِ وَالظُّهْرِ لَازِمٌ وَأَنَّهَا غَيْرُ سَاقِطَةٌ وَأَنَّ الرُّخْصَةَ إِنَّمَا أُرِيدُ بِهَا مَنْ لَمْ تَجِبْ عَلَيْهِ الْجُمُعَةُ مِمَّنْ شَهِدَ الْعِيدَ مِنْ أَهْلِ الْبَوَادِي وَاللَّهُ أَعْلَمُ وَهَذَا تَأْوِيلٌ تُعْضِدُهُ الْأَصُولُ وَتَقْوُمُ عَلَيْهِ الدَّلَائِلُ وَمَنْ خَالَفَهُ فَلَا دَلِيلَ مَعَهُ وَلَا حُجَّةَ لَهُ

It has become clear in this narration and al-Thawrī's narration of this hadith that the Messenger of Allāh ﷺ held Friday prayer with the people that day. In this is evidence that the obligation of Friday and midday prayer [zuhr] is binding and that it does not drop, and that the dispensation [rukḥṣa] was intended only for those upon whom Friday is not obligatory among those who attended the Eid from the Bedouins. And Allāh knows best. This is an interpretation [ta’wīl] that the fundamental principles [uṣūl] support and that the evidences establish. Whoever opposes it has no evidence with him and no proof.

فَإِنْ احْتَجَّ مُحْتَجٌّ بِمَا حَدَّثَنَا عَنْ عَبْدِ الْوَارِثِ قَالَ حَدَّثَنَا قَاسِمُ قَالَ حَدَّثَنَا أَبُو قَلَابَةَ قَالَ حَدَّثَنَا عَبْدُ اللَّهِ بْنُ حُمْرَانَ قَالَ حَدَّثَنَا عَبْدُ الْحَمِيدِ بْنُ جَعْفَرٍ قَالَ أَخْبَرَنِي أَبِي عَنْ وَهْبِ بْنِ كَيْسَانَ قَالَ اجْتَمَعَ عِيدَانِ عَلَى عَهْدِ ابْنِ الرُّبَيْرِ فَصَلَّى الْعِيدَ وَلَمْ

يَخْرُجُ إِلَى الْجُمُعَةِ قَالَ فَذَكَرْتُ ذَلِكَ لِابْنِ عَبَّاسٍ فَقَالَ مَا أَمَاطَ عَنْ سُنَّةِ نَبِيِّهِ فَذَكَرْتُ ذَلِكَ لِابْنِ الزُّبَيْرِ فَقَالَ هَكَذَا صَنَعَ بِنَا عُمَرُ

If someone argues with what ‘Abd al-Wārith narrated to us, he said: Qāsim narrated to us, he said: Abū Qilāba narrated to us, he said: ‘Abd Allāh ibn Ḥumrān narrated to us, he said: ‘Abd al-Ḥamīd ibn Ja‘far narrated to us, he said: My father informed me from Wahb ibn Kaysān who said: "Two festivals coincided during the time of Ibn al-Zubayr. He prayed the Eid and did not go out for Friday prayer." He said: "I mentioned this to Ibn ‘Abbās, and he said: 'He did not deviate from the practice [sunna] of his Prophet.' I mentioned this to Ibn al-Zubayr, and he said: 'This is how ‘Umar acted with us.'"

قِيلَ لَهُ هَذَا حَدِيثٌ اضْطَرَبَ فِي إِسْنَادِهِ فَرَوَاهُ يَحْيَى الْقَطَّانُ قَالَ حَدَّثَنَا عَبْدُ الْحَمِيدِ بْنُ جَعْفَرٍ قَالَ أَخْبَرَنِي وَهْبُ بْنُ كَيْسَانَ قَالَ اجْتَمَعَ عَلَيَّ عَهْدُ ابْنِ الزُّبَيْرِ عِيدَانِ فَأَخَّرَ الْخُرُوجَ حَتَّى تَعَالَى النَّهَارُ ثُمَّ خَرَجَ فَخَطَبَ فَأَطَالَ الْخُطْبَةَ ثُمَّ نَزَلَ فَصَلَّى رَكْعَتَيْنِ وَلَمْ يُصَلِّ لِلنَّاسِ يَوْمَئِذٍ الْجُمُعَةَ فَذَكَرْتُ ذَلِكَ لِابْنِ عَبَّاسٍ فَقَالَ أَصَابَ السُّنَّةَ

It is said to him: This is a hadith whose chain of transmission [isnād] is confused. Yaḥyā al-Qaṭṭān narrated it, he said: ‘Abd al-Ḥamīd ibn Ja‘far narrated to us, he said: Wahb ibn Kaysān informed me, he said: "Two festivals coincided during the time of Ibn al-Zubayr. He delayed going out until the day became high, then he went out and delivered a sermon, lengthening the sermon. Then he came down and prayed two units [rak‘atayn] and did not pray Friday prayer for the people that day." This was mentioned to Ibn ‘Abbās, and he said: "He hit upon the practice [sunna]."

ذَكَرَهُ أَحْمَدُ بْنُ شُعَيْبٍ النَّسَوِيُّ عَنْ سَوَّارٍ عَنِ الْقَطَّانِ عَنْ عَبْدِ الْحَمِيدِ بْنِ جَعْفَرٍ لَمْ يَقُلْ عَنْ أَبِيهِ عَنْ وَهْبِ بْنِ كَيْسَانَ وَذَكَرَ أَنَّ ذَلِكَ حِينَ تَعَالَى النَّهَارُ وَأَنَّهُ أَطَالَ الْخُطْبَةَ وَقَدْ يُحْتَمَلُ أَنْ يَكُونَ صَلَّى تِلْكَ الصَّلَاةَ فَذَكَرَهُ أَحْمَدُ بْنُ شُعَيْبٍ النَّسَوِيُّ عَنْ سَوَّارٍ عَنِ الْقَطَّانِ عَنْ عَبْدِ الْحَمِيدِ بْنِ جَعْفَرٍ لَمْ يَقُلْ عَنْ أَبِيهِ عَنْ وَهْبِ بْنِ كَيْسَانَ وَذَكَرَ أَنَّ ذَلِكَ حِينَ تَعَالَى النَّهَارُ وَأَنَّهُ أَطَالَ الْخُطْبَةَ وَقَدْ يُحْتَمَلُ أَنْ يَكُونَ صَلَّى تِلْكَ الصَّلَاةَ فِي أَوَّلِ الرَّوَالِ وَسَقَطَتْ صَلَاةُ الْعِيدِ وَاسْتَجَزَى بِمَا صَلَّى فِي ذَلِكَ الْوَقْتِ

Aḥmad ibn Shu‘ayb al-Nasā’ī mentioned it from Sawwār from al-Qaṭṭān from ‘Abd al-Ḥamīd ibn Ja‘far, but he did not say "from his father from Wahb ibn Kaysān." He mentioned that this was when the day became high and that he lengthened the sermon. It is possible that he prayed that prayer at the beginning of the meridian [zawāl], and the Eid prayer was dropped, and he was satisfied with what he prayed at that time.

وَفِي رِوَايَةِ الْأَعْمَشِ عَنْ عَطَاءٍ عَنِ ابْنِ الزُّبَيْرِ أَنَّ النَّاسَ جَمَعُوا فِي ذَلِكَ الْيَوْمِ وَلَمْ يَخْرُجْ إِلَيْهِمْ ابْنُ الزُّبَيْرِ وَكَانَ ابْنُ عَبَّاسٍ بِالطَّائِفِ فَلَمَّا قَدِمَ ذَكَرْنَا لَهُ ذَلِكَ فَقَالَ أَصَابَ السُّنَّةَ

In the narration of al-A‘mash from ‘Aṭā’ from Ibn al-Zubayr, the people held Friday prayer on that day and Ibn al-Zubayr did not go out to them. Ibn ‘Abbās was in al-Ṭā’if, and when he arrived, we mentioned this to him, and he said: "He hit upon the practice [sunna]."

وَهَذَا يُحْتَمَلُ أَنْ يَكُونَ صَلَّى الظُّهْرَ ابْنُ الزُّبَيْرِ فِي بَيْتِهِ وَأَنَّ الرُّحْصَةَ وَرَدَتْ فِي تَرْكِ الْاجْتِمَاعِ لِمَا فِي ذَلِكَ مِنَ الْمَشَقَّةِ لِأَنَّ الظُّهْرَ تَسْفُطُ

This can be interpreted to mean that Ibn al-Zubayr prayed midday prayer [zūhr] in his house, and that the dispensation [rukḥṣa] was granted for abandoning the two gatherings due to the hardship in that, not that midday prayer [zūhr] drops.

وَأَمَّا حَدِيثُ إِسْرَائِيلَ عَنْ عُثْمَانَ بْنِ الْمُغْبِرَةِ النَّقَفِيِّ عَنْ إِيَّاسِ بْنِ أَبِي رَمْلَةَ الشَّامِيِّ قَالَ شَهِدْتُ مُعَاوِيَةَ بْنَ أَبِي سُفْيَانَ يَسْأَلُ زَيْدَ بْنَ أَرْقَمَ هَلْ شَهِدْتَ مَعَ رَسُولِ اللَّهِ ﷺ عِيدَيْنِ اجْتَمَعَا فِي يَوْمٍ قَالَ نَعَمْ قَالَ فَكَيْفَ صَنَعَ قَالَ صَلَّى الْعِيدَ ثُمَّ رَخَّصَ فِي الْجُمُعَةِ فَقَالَ مَنْ شَاءَ أَنْ يُصَلِّيَ فَلْيُصَلِّ

As for the hadith of Isrā'īl from 'Uthmān ibn al-Mughīra al-Thaqafī from Iyās ibn Abī Ramla al-Shāmī, he said: "I witnessed Mu'āwiya ibn Abī Sufyān asking Zayd ibn Arqam: 'Did you witness with the Messenger of Allāh ﷺ two festivals that coincided on one day?' He said: 'Yes.' He said: 'How did he act?' He said: 'He prayed the Eid, then granted a dispensation [rakhkhaṣa] regarding Friday prayer and said: "Whoever wishes to pray, let him pray."'"

وَهَذَا الْحَدِيثُ لَمْ يَذْكُرْهُ الْبُخَارِيُّ وَذَكَرَهُ أَبُو دَاوُدَ عَنْ مُحَمَّدِ بْنِ كَثِيرٍ عَنْ إِسْرَائِيلَ وَذَكَرَهُ النَّسَائِيُّ عَنْ عَمْرِو بْنِ عَلِيٍّ عَنِ ابْنِ مَهْدِيٍّ عَنِ إِسْرَائِيلَ وَلَيْسَ فِيهِ دَلِيلٌ عَلَى سُقُوطِ الْجُمُعَةِ وَإِنَّمَا فِيهِ دَلِيلٌ أَنَّهُ رَخَّصَ فِي شُهُودِهَا

This hadith was not mentioned by al-Bukhārī. Abū Dāwūd mentioned it from Muḥammad ibn Kathīr from Isrā'īl, and al-Nasā'ī mentioned it from 'Amr ibn 'Alī from Ibn Mahdī from Isrā'īl. There is no evidence in it for the dropping of Friday, but rather there is evidence that he granted a dispensation [rakhkhaṣa] regarding attending it.

وَأَحْسَنُ مَا يُتَأَوَّلُ فِي ذَلِكَ أَنَّ الْأَذَانَ رُخَّصَ بِهِ مَنْ لَمْ تَجِبِ الْجُمُعَةُ عَلَيْهِ مِمَّنْ شَهِدَ ذَلِكَ الْعِيدَ وَاللَّهُ أَعْلَمُ وَإِذَا احْتَمَلْتُ هَذِهِ الْأَتَارُ مِنَ التَّأْوِيلِ مَا ذَكَرْنَا لَمْ يَجُزْ لِمُسْلِمٍ أَنْ يَذْهَبَ إِلَى سُقُوطِ فَرَضِ الْجُمُعَةِ عَمَّنْ وَجَبَتْ عَلَيْهِ

The best interpretation [ta'wīl] for this is that the dispensation was granted regarding the call [adhān] for those upon whom Friday is not obligatory among those who attended that Eid. And Allāh knows best. When these reports [āthār] admit of the interpretation [ta'wīl] we have mentioned, it is not permissible for a Muslim to hold the position of the dropping of the Friday obligation from those upon whom it is obligatory.

لِأَنَّ اللَّهَ عَزَّ وَجَلَّ يَقُولُ يَا أَيُّهَا الَّذِينَ آمَنُوا إِذَا نُودِيَ لِلصَّلَاةِ مِنْ يَوْمِ الْجُمُعَةِ فَاسْعَوْا إِلَىٰ ذِكْرِ اللَّهِ وَلَمْ يُخَصَّ اللَّهُ وَرَسُولُهُ يَوْمَ عِيدٍ مِنْ غَيْرِهِ مِنْ وَجْهِ تَجِبُ حُجَّتُهُ فَكَيْفَ بِمَنْ ذَهَبَ إِلَىٰ سُقُوطِ الْجُمُعَةِ وَالظُّهْرِ الْمُجْتَمِعِ عَلَيْهِمَا فِي الْكِتَابِ وَالسُّنَّةِ وَالْإِجْمَاعِ بِأَحَادِيثٍ لَيْسَ مِنْهَا حَدِيثٌ إِلَّا وَفِيهِ مَطْعَنٌ لِأَهْلِ الْعِلْمِ بِالْحَدِيثِ

Because Allāh (Mighty and Majestic) says: "O you who believe! When the call is made for prayer on the day of Friday, then hasten to the remembrance of Allāh," (Sura al-Jumu'a: 9) and Allāh and His Messenger did not specify an Eid day from others in a way that would make its proof obligatory. How then with one who holds the position of the dropping of Friday and midday prayer [zūhr], which are agreed upon in the Book, the Sunna, and consensus [ijmā'], based on hadiths, none of which is free from criticism by the people of knowledge of hadith? End of quotes.

iii 1/113, see here - <https://app.turath.io/book/6160?page=46>

iv 1/188, see here - <https://app.turath.io/book/16050?page=269>

^v In his recension of Muwatta Mālik (p. 88, see here - <https://app.turath.io/book/16050?page=269>)

^{vi} **Imam Abū Bakr ibn al-Mundhir** (d. 319 AH) said in his book *al-Awsaṭ fī al-Sunan wa'l-Ijmā' wa'l-Ikhtilāf* (The Middle [Path] in Traditions, Consensus, and Disagreement, 4/291):

٢١٨٥ - أَخْبَرَنَا الرَّبِيعُ قَالَ: أَخْبَرَنَا الشَّافِعِيُّ، قَالَ: أَخْبَرَنَا مَالِكٌ، عَنِ ابْنِ شِهَابٍ، عَنْ أَبِي عُبَيْدٍ، مَوْلَى ابْنِ أَزْهَرَ قَالَ: «شَهِدْتُ الْعِيدَ مَعَ عُثْمَانَ بْنِ عَفَّانَ فَجَاءَ فَصَلَّى ثُمَّ انْصَرَفَ فَقَالَ: إِنَّهُ قَدْ اجْتَمَعَ لَكُمْ فِي يَوْمِكُمْ هَذَا عِيدَانِ فَمَنْ أَحَبَّ مِنْ أَهْلِ الْعَالِيَةِ أَنْ يَنْتَظِرَ الْجُمُعَةَ فَلْيَنْتَظِرْهَا، وَمَنْ أَحَبَّ أَنْ يَرْجِعَ فَلْيَرْجِعْ فَقَدْ أُذِنْتُ لَهُ»

2185 - Al-Rabī' informed us, he said: Al-Shāfi'ī informed us, he said: Mālik informed us, from Ibn Shihāb, from Abū 'Ubayd, the freed slave of Ibn Azhar, he said: "I witnessed the Eid with 'Uthmān ibn 'Affān. He came and prayed, then departed and said: 'Two Eids have occurred together for you on this day of yours. Whoever among the people of the highlands wishes to wait for Friday [prayer], let him wait for it, and whoever wishes to return, let him return, for I have given him permission.'"

وَقَالَ الشَّافِعِيُّ مِثْلَهُ، وَقَالَ: لَا يَجُوزُ هَذَا لِأَحَدٍ مِنْ أَهْلِ الْمَصْرِ أَنْ يَدْعُوا أَنْ يُجْمَعُوا إِلَّا مِنْ عُدْرٍ، وَقَالَ الثُّعْمَانُ فِي الْعِيدَيْنِ يَجْتَمِعَانِ فِي يَوْمٍ وَاحِدٍ: يَشْهَدُهُمَا جَمِيعًا الْأَوَّلُ سُنَّةً وَالْآخِرُ فَرِيضَةً، وَلَا يَتْرُكُ وَاحِدٌ مِنْهُمَا

Al-Shāfi'ī said the same, and he said: "This is not permissible for anyone among the people of the city to abandon attending Friday [prayer] except for an excuse." Al-Nu'mān [Abū Ḥanīfa] said regarding two Eids occurring on one day: "One attends both of them - the first is Sunna and the other is an obligation [farīḍa], and neither one of them should be abandoned."

قَالَ أَبُو بَكْرٍ: أَجْمَعَ أَهْلُ الْعِلْمِ عَلَى وَجُوبِ صَلَاةِ الْجُمُعَةِ، وَذَلَّتِ الْأَخْبَارُ الثَّابِتَةُ عَنْ رَسُولِ اللَّهِ ﷺ عَلَى أَنْ فَرَائِضَ الصَّلَوَاتِ خَمْسٌ، وَصَلَاةُ الْعِيدَيْنِ لَيْسَ مِنَ الْخَمْسِ، وَإِذَا دَلَّ الْكِتَابُ وَالسُّنَّةُ وَالْإِتِّفَاقُ عَلَى وَجُوبِ صَلَاةِ الْجُمُعَةِ وَذَلَّتِ الْأَخْبَارُ عَنْ رَسُولِ اللَّهِ ﷺ عَلَى أَنْ فَرَائِضَ الصَّلَوَاتِ الْخَمْسِ، وَإِذَا دَلَّ الْكِتَابُ وَالسُّنَّةُ وَالْإِتِّفَاقُ عَلَى وَجُوبِ صَلَاةِ الْجُمُعَةِ وَذَلَّتِ الْأَخْبَارُ عَنْ رَسُولِ اللَّهِ ﷺ عَلَى أَنْ صَلَاةُ الْعِيدِ تَطَوُّعٌ لَمْ يَجِزْ تَرْكُ فَرِيضٍ بِتَطَوُّعٍ

Abū Bakr said: The people of knowledge have reached consensus [ajma'a] on the obligation of Friday prayer, and the established reports from the Messenger of Allah ﷺ indicate that the obligatory prayers are five, and the two Eid prayers are not among the five. When the Book [Qur'an], the Sunna, and consensus indicate the obligation of Friday prayer, and the reports from the Messenger of Allah ﷺ indicate that the obligatory prayers are five, and the two Eid prayers are not among the five, and when the Book, the Sunna, and consensus indicate the obligation of Friday prayer and the reports from the Messenger of Allah ﷺ indicate that Eid prayer is voluntary [taṭawwu'], it is not permissible to abandon an obligation [farḍ] for something voluntary [taṭawwu'].

^{vii} No. 5572, see here - <https://app.turath.io/book/1681?page=8320>

^{viii} 1/178

^{ix} In his work known as al-Muntaqā Sharḥ al-Muwaṭṭa' (1/317, see here - <https://app.turath.io/book/6684?page=316>)

^x Al-Bayhaqī mentioned the following in his Ma'rifat al-Sunan (5/117):

قَالَ الشَّافِعِيُّ فِي رِوَايَةِ أَبِي سَعِيدٍ: وَلَا يَجُوزُ هَذَا لِأَحَدٍ مِنْ أَهْلِ الْمِصْرِ، وَحَمَلَ الْحَدِيثَ عَلَى مَنْ حَضَرَ مِنْ غَيْرِ أَهْلِ الْمِصْرِ، فَيَنْصَرِفُوا إِنْ شَاءُوا إِلَى أَهْلِيهِمْ وَلَا يَعُودُوا لِلْجُمُعَةِ، وَالِاخْتِيَارُ لَهُمْ أَنْ يُقِيمُوا حَتَّى يُجَمَّعُوا إِنْ قَدَرُوا

Meaning: Al-Shāfi'ī said in the narration of Abū Sa'īd: This is not permissible for anyone from the people of the city [miṣr]. He interpreted the hadith as applying to those who attended it from other than the people of the city, so they may depart if they wish to their families and not return for Friday. **The preferable choice for them is to remain until they hold Friday prayer if they are able.**

^{xi} 1/274, see here - <https://app.turath.io/book/1655?page=259>

^{xii} The full quote from al-Bināya Sharḥ al-Hidāya (3/97):

وقال ابن عبد البر: سقوط الجمعة والظهر بصلاة العيد متروك مهجور، ولا يقول عليه وتأويل ذلك في حق أهل البادية ومن لا يجب عليه الجمعة، ويستحب تأخير صلاة العيد في الفطر، وتعجيلها في النحر لتعجيل الأضاحي وخروج الوقت في أثنائها يفسدها كالجمعة.

Ibn 'Abd al-Barr said: The dropping of Friday and Zuhr prayers by means of Eid prayer is abandoned and forsaken, and no one maintains this [position]. The interpretation [ta'wīl] of this is regarding the people of the desert [Bedouins] and those upon whom Friday prayer is not obligatory. It is recommended to delay Eid prayer on [Eid] al-Fiṭr and to hasten it on [Eid] al-Naḥr (the day of sacrificing the animals) in order to hasten the sacrifices [aḍāḥī]. The departure of its time during [the prayer] corrupts it, like Friday [prayer].

^{xiii} 3/304, see here - <https://app.turath.io/book/767?page=1108>

^{xiv} I'lā' al-Sunan is a comprehensive work elucidating hadiths that support the positions and methodologies of the Ḥanafī school of Islamic jurisprudence. The text was composed as a scholarly response to critiques levelled by the Ahl-i Ḥadīth movement in the Indian subcontinent, by Shaykh Zafar Aḥmad 'Uthmānī (al-Tahānawī, d. 1974). The discussion on this topic is in I'lā' al-Sunan (8/92-98).

^{xiv} Ibn 'Abd al-Barr (d. 463 AH) expounded on this in his al-Istidhkār (2/385) as follows:

وَقَالَ الثَّوْرِيُّ وَأَبُو حَنِيفَةَ وَالشَّافِعِيُّ وَأَكْثَرُ أَهْلِ الْعِلْمِ إِنَّ إِدْنَ عَثْمَانَ كَانَ لِمَنْ لَا تَلْزَمُهُ الْجُمُعَةُ مِنْ أَهْلِ الْعَوَالِي لِأَنَّ الْجُمُعَةَ لَا تَجِبُ إِلَّا عَلَى أَهْلِ الْمَصْرِ عِنْدَ الْكُوفِيِّينَ

Al-Thawrī, Abū Ḥanīfa, al-Shāfi'ī, and most of the people of knowledge said that 'Uthmān's permission was for those upon whom Friday prayer is not binding from among the people of the highlands, because Friday prayer is only obligatory upon the people of the city according to the Kufans.

وَأَمَّا الشَّافِعِيُّ فَتَجِبُ عِنْدَهُ عَلَى مَنْ سَمِعَ الْإِذَاءَ مِنْ خَارِجِ الْمَصْرِ وَلَا يَخْتَلِفُ الْعُلَمَاءُ فِي وُجُوبِ الْجُمُعَةِ عَلَى مَنْ كَانَ بِالْمَصْرِ بِالْعَا مِنَ الرِّجَالِ الْأَحْرَارِ سَمِعَ الْإِذَاءَ أَوْ لَمْ يَسْمَعْهُ

As for al-Shāfi'ī, it is obligatory in his view upon whoever hears the call [adhān] from outside the city. The scholars do not differ regarding the obligation of Friday prayer upon whoever is in the city - adult free men - whether he heard the call or did not hear it.

قَالَ أَبُو عُمَرَ وَقَدْ رُوِيَ فِي هَذَا الْبَابِ عَنِ ابْنِ الزُّبَيْرِ وَعَطَاءٍ قَوْلٌ مُنْكَرٌ أَنْكَرَهُ الْفُقَهَاءُ الْأَمْصَارَ وَلَمْ يَقُلْ بِهِ أَحَدٌ مِنْهُمْ وَذَلِكَ أَنَّ عَبْدَ الرَّزَّاقِ رَوَى عَنْ بَنِي جُرَيْجٍ قَالَ قَالَ عَطَاءٌ إِنْ اجْتَمَعَ يَوْمُ الْجُمُعَةِ وَيَوْمُ الْفِطْرِ فِي يَوْمٍ وَاحِدٍ فَلْيَجْمَعُهَا يُصَلِّي رَكْعَتَيْنِ فَقَطْ وَلَا يُصَلِّي بَعْدَهَا حَتَّى الْعَصْرِ

Abū 'Umar (Ibn 'Abd al-Barr) said: A rejected opinion [qawl munkar] has been narrated in this chapter from Ibn al-Zubayr and 'Aṭā' that the jurists of the cities rejected and none of them held. This is that 'Abd al-Razzāq narrated from Ibn Jurayj who said: 'Aṭā' said: "If Friday and the day of Fiṭr occur together on one day, let him combine them - he prays only two rak'ahs and does not pray after that until 'Aṣr."

قال ابن جُرَيْجٍ ثُمَّ أَخْبَرَنَا عِنْدَ ذَلِكَ قَالَ اجْتَمَعَ يَوْمُ فِطْرِ وَيَوْمُ جُمُعَةٍ فِي يَوْمٍ وَاحِدٍ فِي زَمَنِ ابْنِ الزُّبَيْرِ فَقَالَ ابْنُ الزُّبَيْرِ عِيدَانِ اجْتَمَعَا فِي يَوْمٍ وَاحِدٍ فَجَمَعَهُمَا جَمِيعًا صَلَّى رَكْعَتَيْنِ بِرُكُوعٍ صَلَاةِ الْفِطْرِ ثُمَّ لَمْ يَزِدْ عَلَيْهَا حَتَّى صَلَّى الْعَصْرَ

Ibn Jurayj said: Then he informed us about that, saying: "A day of Fiṭr and a day of Friday prayer occurred together on one day during the time of Ibn al-Zubayr. Ibn al-Zubayr said: 'Two Eids have occurred together on one day,' so he combined them both. He prayed two rak'as in the morning - the Fiṭr prayer - then did not add to it until he prayed 'Aṣr."

وَرَوَى سَعِيدُ بْنُ الْمُسَيَّبِ عَنِ قَتَادَةَ قَالَ سَمِعْتُ عَطَاءً يَقُولُ اجْتَمَعَ عِيدَانِ عَلَى عَهْدِ ابْنِ الزُّبَيْرِ فَصَلَّى الْعِيدَ ثُمَّ لَمْ يَخْرُجْ إِلَى الْعَصْرِ

Sa'īd ibn al-Musayyab narrated from Qatāda who said: I heard 'Aṭā' say: "Two Eids occurred together during the time of Ibn al-Zubayr, so he prayed the Eid prayer then did not come out until 'Aṣr."

قال أبو عمر أما فعل ابن الزُّبَيْرِ وَمَا نَقَلَهُ عَطَاءٌ مِنْ ذَلِكَ وَأَفْتَى بِهِ عَلَى أَنَّهُ قَدْ اخْتَلَفَ عَنْهُ فَلَا وَجْهَ فِيهِ عِنْدَ جَمَاعَةِ الْفُقَهَاءِ وَهُوَ عِنْدَهُمْ خَطَأٌ إِنْ كَانَ عَلَى ظَاهِرِهِ لِأَنَّ الْفَرَضَ مِنْ صَلَاةِ الْجُمُعَةِ لَا يَسْقُطُ بِإِقَامَةِ السُّنَّةِ فِي الْعِيدِ عِنْدَ أَحَدٍ مِنْ أَهْلِ الْعِلْمِ

Abū 'Umar said: “As for what Ibn al-Zubayr did and what 'Aṭā' transmitted from that and gave as a legal opinion, although it has been differently reported from him, there is no basis for it according to the community of jurists, and it is an error in their view if it is taken at face value, because the obligation [farḍ] of Friday prayer is not dropped by performing the Sunna of Eid according to any of the people of knowledge.”

^{xvi} Al-Kawtharī did not mention which work by Ibn al-‘Arabī he was quoting from. A similar quote is found Abū Bakr ibn al-‘Arabī's ‘Āriḍat al-Aḥwadhī (3/13) as follows:

وليس فيها ترك الامام الجمعة كما فعل الزبير وانما فيها الرخصة لمن كان ذا منزل

“There is no abandoning of Friday prayer by the Imam in them as al-Zubayr did, but rather there is a dispensation [rukḥṣa] for one who had a dwelling.”

Compiled by:

Abul Hasan Hussain Ahmed

June 4th, 2025/8th Dhu'l Hijja 1446 AH
(www.darultahqiq.com, Updates on
Telegram: https://t.me/Darul_Tahqiq)